



Australian Government

Australian Fisheries Management Authority

Shark Resource Assessment Group (SharkRAG) Meeting 3 2022

Meeting minutes

December 2, 2022

Agenda item 1. Preliminaries

1.1 Welcome and apologies

1. The Chair opened the meeting at 0900 hrs with an Acknowledgement of Country and welcomed members and observers.
2. Members and participants noted the meeting was being recorded.

Attendees	Membership
Mr. Sandy Morison	Chair
Mr. Roshan Hanamseth	Executive Officer
Dr. Lara Ainley	AFMA member
Dr. Robin Thomson	Scientific member
Dr. Andrew Penney	Scientific member
Mr. Kyriakos Toumazos	Industry member
Mr. Jamie Papas	Industry member
Mr. Craig Harris	Industry member
Mr. Leigh Castle	Industry member
Ms. Anissa Lawrence	Environment/Conservation member
Dr. Julian Morison	Economic member
Dr. Charlie Huveneers	Scientific member
Apologies	Membership
Mr. Jamie Papas	Industry member
Mr. Leigh Castle	Industry member

Presenters	Organisation
Dr. Paul Burch	CSIRO
Invited attendees	Organisation

Mr. James Woodhams	ABARES
Mr. Ross Bromley	Southern Shark Industry Association
Dr. Miriana Sporcic	CSIRO
Observers	Organisation
Mr. Dan Corrie	AFMA
Dr. Nastaran Mazloumi	AFMA
Mr. Kurt Davis	ABARES

1.2 Declarations of interest

3. The chair invited SharkRAG members to discuss attendee declarations of interest.
4. SharkRAG members followed the declarations of interest procedure as outlined in Fisheries Administration Paper 12, updating the table included at Attachment A.
5. The following conflicts of interest were declared with specific agenda items:
 - a. Industry member Mr. Toumazos, Mr. Bromley and Mr. Harris noted a conflict of interest with agenda item 2. Metier analysis and TAC setting.
 - b. Dr. Thomson, Dr. Penney, Dr. Burch, and Dr. Sporcic noted conflict of interest with agenda item 3. Research priorities.
6. The chair noted that the above individuals will leave the meeting to discuss the approach for the respective agenda items. SharkRAG members agreed, consistent with the approach taken in previous meetings, that members with conflicts of interests were welcomed to be part of discussions but not take part in the formulation of advice or recommendations.

1.3 Adoption of agenda

7. The AFMA member noted that a discussion on how weight was recorded for the main shark species was included under agenda item. 4 Other business.
8. SharkRAG adopted the draft agenda (Attachment B) as final.

Agenda item 2. Metier analysis

9. The AFMA member introduced the agenda item, noting that the metier analysis was considered at the October 2022 meeting and that SharkRAG requested that Dr Burch:
 - a. review the inputs and present an updated metier analysis at their next meeting (this meeting), including estimates of bycatch under several gummy shark TAC scenarios; and

- b. replicate the 'logbook' approach applied in 2021 as an alternative to recommending a school shark bycatch TAC for the 2023-24 fishing season.

10. Dr. Burch presented the metier analysis, noting that:

- a. The objectives were to quantify the likely unavoidable school shark bycatch using a metier approach.
- b. the purpose of the metier analysis was to inform the setting of target species TACs, and not that of rebuilding species.
- c. The metier analysis used recent logbook data to classify groups of fishing operations with common characteristics (e.g., species composition, location, depth) into metiers, which were then used to estimate the ratio of target species to school shark catch.
- d. The analysis assumed target species catches for 2023 which are then used to estimate the associated bycatch of school shark in 2023.
- e. The logbook discards used in each metier have been scaled up by 10% due to the logbook extract of discards undertaken by CSIRO being approximately 10% lower than those estimated by AFMA. Mr. Woodhams confirmed that the logbook recorded discard data previously used for the ABARES fisheries status reports also initially did not match with the AFMA data.
- f. The metier analysis assumed that the ratio of under-reporting of landed catches for both school shark and gummy shark in logbook data were the same.

11. SharkRAG discussed the updated metier analysis, noting the following:

- a. SharkRAG noted the action item: ABARES, CSIRO and AFMA to discuss the issue of logbook recorded discard data not matching across the AFMA, CSIRO and ABARES summaries. Although the ABARES data does match now, it's for CSIRO to investigate the errors.
- b. Logbooks consistently under report catches compared to CDRs due to a desire not to over-report catches in logbook (estimation error would result in noise but not in bias). It is therefore important to apply a CDR:logbook correction factor whenever necessary.
- c. The proportions of school shark catches in the hook gummy shark west SA metier were much higher compared to other metiers. Dr. Thomson and Mr. Toumazos confirmed that this was due to the spatial distribution of school shark.
- d. For the estimate of school shark catch, as modified by changed gummy shark TAC in 2021, state and recreational catches were not included in the model. This was not necessarily an issue for the metier analyses if catches in these sectors were not changing through time. Dr. Thomson noted that these numbers need to be periodically assessed. Management arrangements such as OCS arrangements with state authorities aim to keep state catches in check. In addition, the CKMR report stated that future catches were completed using an

exploitation rate rather than a fixed catch to recognise increases in biomass and unavoidable catch through time.

- e. The updated estimates from the metier-based approach were still lower than the 2021 method, however, the estimate provided by the 'logbook' approach falls within the 95% confidence intervals of the estimates provided by the metier-based approach.
 - f. An assumption of the metier analysis is that the ratio of logbook to CDR catches are similar. The 2021 Gummy Shark GHAT CDR catch being higher than logbook was likely due to an error in recording sub-Fishery in the CSIRO CDR data –this will be corrected in 2023.
 - g. When comparing the two methods, it was important to maintain the same assumptions.
 - h. There were uncertainties in the confidence intervals for the metier analysis. These uncertainties are underestimated because the model does not account for the variations in gummy shark target species catch in the metiers and the change in school shark bycatch rate among the metiers.
 - i. Trunked weight is used for discards, however, in the assessments it is converted to whole weight using a conversion factor.
12. Mr. Bromley, Mr. Harris, and Mr. Toumazos left the meeting for the formulation of advice.
13. SharkRAG recommended using the 'logbook' method annually as it was cost effective and required much less analysis time when compared to the metier analysis. The 'logbook' method also produced a result with a more conservative approach. In addition, SharkRAG recommended that the metier analysis be undertaken every 3 or 5 years as the approach was considered to be a more robust scientific assessment and it would be good practice to check outputs of the 'logbook' approach with the outputs from the metier-based approach on a semi-regular basis. SharkRAG recommended that total annual fishing mortality (including state and recreational catch) should be maintained below the morality estimates provided by the 2019 CKMR assessment.

Agenda item 3. Research Priorities

14. The AFMA member presented the research priorities and proposals received, four were relevant to research priorities identified by SharkRAG. An additional proposal was received for additional funding to continue an existing project on monitoring upper-slope dogfish and establishing baseline data.
15. Dr. Thomson and Dr. Sporcic noted a conflict of interest and left the meeting.
16. A research proposal feedback form was completed for each proposal. This advice will be provided to the AFMA Research Committee.
17. SharkRAG recommended that future research applicants to include more detail of cost breakdown in their applications.

Agenda item 4. Other business

18. The AFMA member was seeking to clarify if the numbers (retained and/or discard weight in logbooks and/or CDRs) for shark species was recorded as trunked or whole weight.
19. Mr. Corrie confirmed that in the gillnet sector, trunked weight was currently used for recording in logbooks and CDRs.
20. Mr. Bromley confirmed that trunked weight was always used for recording discard weight.

Close of meeting

21. The chair thanked the RAG, AFMA member and the EO for their contribution and closed the meeting at 1330 pm.



Attachment A

Shark Resource Assessment Group (SharkRAG) SharkRAG 3 2022, 2 December (virtual)

Agenda item 1. Preliminaries

Agenda item 1.1. Welcome and apologies

Purpose: FOR INFORMATION

The Chair (Mr Sandy Morison) will open the SharkRAG meeting with an acknowledgement of country.

The Chair will also facilitate introductions and apologies and inform participants that the meeting will be recorded to assist with the preparation of the meeting minutes.

Recommendations

That SharkRAG:

1. **NOTE** the acknowledgement of country from the Chair;
2. **NOTE** any apologies received from members;
3. **NOTE** the meeting is being recorded to assist with the preparation of the meeting minutes;
4. **AGREE** to commence proceedings.

Background

AFMA appointed the following members to SharkRAG for the period from 1 July 2022 up until 31 Dec 2023.

Members

Mr Sandy Morison	Chair
Dr Robin Thomson	Scientific member
Dr Andrew Penney	Scientific member
Dr Charlie Huveneers	Scientific member
Dr Julian Morison	Economic member
Mr Kyri Toumazos	Industry member
Mr Leigh Castle	Industry member
Mr Craig Harris	Industry member
Mr Jamie Papas	Industry member
Anissa Lawrence	Conservation member
Dr Lara Ainley	AFMA member
Mr Roshan Hanamseth	Executive Officer - AFMA

The following persons have been invited or requested to attend.

Invited Participants

Ross Bromley	SSIA
--------------	------

James Woodhams	ABARES
Dr Paul Burch	CSIRO
Dr Miriana Sporcic	CSIRO

Observers

Dan Corrie	AFMA
Nastaran Mazloumi	AFMA
Kurt Davis	ABARES

Apologies

Leigh Castle	Industry member
Jamie Papas	Industry member

Agenda item 1.2. Declarations of interest

Purpose: FOR ACTION

For SharkRAG to consider the declared conflicts of interest from members, invited participants and observers and decide on how these conflicts of interest will be managed during the meeting.

Recommendations

That SharkRAG:

1. **NOTE** the requirements for members to declare all relevant interest, not limited to pecuniary gain.
2. **NOTE** SharkRAG members', invited participants' and observers' declared interests in **Table 1**.
3. **AGREE** on how any potential conflicts of interest declared in relation to agenda items will be managed.

Background

All interests in the matter being considered, not limited to pecuniary gain, must be declared. Types of interests that members must declare include but are not limited to:

- A financial or economic interest such as the ownership or control of concessions, businesses or assets related to the fishery.
- Any employment by a business or organisation relevant to the fishery.
- Any membership of a group or organisation relevant to the fishery.
- Projects or campaigns that the member or the member's organisation/group has or has planned that are relevant to the fishery.
- A family or close associate having such an interest, which may or might reasonably appear to be thought by an observer to impair the ability of the member to perform their duties properly in relation to the matter being considered.

Any interests should be disclosed prior to the item relevant to the interest being discussed. The other RAG members should then discuss the nature of the interest, decide if there is any conflict of interest, and what action should be taken when that item is discussed. However, common sense should be used for determining if any conflict of interest exists.

If the RAG decides at any time that a conflict of interest exists and that this conflict is likely to interfere with the RAG's consideration of a particular issue/s, the RAG may:

- decide that the member who has disclosed his/her conflict of interest should participate in the discussions concerning the issue but not in formalising the advice/recommendations (in such cases, the member should be asked to retire from the meeting while the decision about their participation is made); or
- ask to hear the member's views on the issue and then require him/her to retire from the meeting while it is discussed by the other members and the advice/recommendation is formalised.

If the RAG decides that a general conflict of interest exists, the RAG should take a more inclusive approach in view of the role and function of RAGs in terms of making use of the expertise of members and allow the members to participate in the discussion and recommendation. As a guide, it is suggested that members with a conflict of interest should be excluded from participating in the discussion and recommendation only if the matter being considered can have a direct benefit to the individual member or member's business/organisation/group rather than all people / businesses / organisations / groups equally.

If the RAG cannot agree as to whether a conflict of interest exists or on the appropriate action to be taken, it is the responsibility of the Chair to decide on the appropriate course of action.

Table 1 outlines meeting attendees' interests. Members invited participants and observers are asked to review the information and provide any corrections or additions to the register.

Table 1. Members', invited participants' and observers' declarations of interest

Member	Position	Interest declared
Alexander (Sandy) Morison	Chair	Director of Morison Aquatic Sciences. Chair of SharkRAG. Contracted by government departments, non-government agencies and companies for a range of fishery related matters including research and for MSC assessments of AFMA managed and other Australian and international fisheries. Have undertaken work for SETFIA in 2021 reviewing a report on matters unrelated to the shark fishery. No pecuniary or other interest in the SESSF shark fishery.
Robin Thomson	Scientific Member	CSIRO, Assessment scientist. Acquiring funding for research purposes. PI of AFMA-CSIRO co-funded project 'Ongoing monitoring of school shark abundance and rebuilding in the SESSF using close kin mark recapture'. Co-investigator on FRDC project to develop harvest strategies for CKMR assessments for school shark and scalefish.
Andrey Penney	Scientific Member	Scientific member on GAB RAG Scientific member on Finfish RAG
Charlie Huveneers	Scientific Member	Associate Professor and research scientist. Potential interest in funding for research. No pecuniary interest or otherwise.
Julian Morison	Economic member	Director, Kuti Co Pty Ltd – SA Pipi quota holder Director, BDO Advisory (SA) Pty Ltd - current contracts with SA & Qld state governments collecting fisheries economic data Member, SA Snapper Management Advisory Committee (PIRSA) Economics member, Scallop Fishery Resource Assessment Group (AFMA) Member, Economics Working Group (AFMA) Member, Human Dimensions Research subprogram (FRDC) Principal & co-investigator on several FRDC research projects

Kyri Toumazos	Industry Member	South Australia/Bass Strait shark fisher, boats fishing with hooks and gillnets. SESSF quota holder. Southern Rock Lobster Board CEO. Declared interests in RBCs.
Leigh Castle	Industry Member	Tasmanian shark hook, scalefish hook and tuna minor line fisher. Owns SESSF quota and vessel statutory fishing rights. Has a declared interest in shark hook interests and RBC recommendations
Craig Harris	Industry Member	Gillnet fisher and SFR holder.
Jamie Papas	Industry Member	Gillnet fisher and SFR holder. Board Director San Remo Fishermen's Co/Op
Anissa Lawrence	Conservation Member	Director of TierraMar Ltd, Independent consultant TierraMar Consulting Pty Ltd Undertakes contracts for a number of Conservation Non-Government Organisations, government departments, non-government agencies and the private sector on a range of fishery related matters. No pecuniary interest. Conservation member on South Australia Rock Lobster MAC Conservation member on GABMAC Conservation member on SPFRAG Director and Chair of Ocean Future Fund Inc
Lara Ainley	AFMA Member	AFMA member, Manager of the Gillnet, Hook and Trap fishery. No interest pecuniary or otherwise.
Roshan Hanamseth	Executive Officer	AFMA EO. No interest pecuniary or otherwise.
Paul Burch	Presenter/Observer	Employed by CSIRO. No interest, pecuniary or otherwise.
Miriana Sporcic	Presenter/Observer	Employed by CSIRO. No interest, pecuniary or otherwise.
Ross Bromley	Invited participant	Employed by SSIA. No interest, pecuniary or otherwise.
James Woodhams	Invited participant	Employed by ABARES. No interest, pecuniary or otherwise.
Dan Corrie	Observer	Employed by AFMA. No interest pecuniary or otherwise
Kurt Davis	Observer	Employed by ABARES. No interest, pecuniary or otherwise.
Nastaran Mazloumi	Observer	Employed by AFMA. No interest pecuniary or otherwise

Agenda item 1.3. Adoption of agenda

Purpose: FOR ACTION

For SharkRAG to discuss any changes to the draft agenda and adopt a final agenda for the meeting.

Recommendations

That SharkRAG:

1. **NOTE** any changes to the draft agenda.
2. **ADOPT** a final agenda for the meeting.

Executive Officer

Dec 2022



Attachment B

Shark Resource Assessment Group (SharkRAG)

SharkRAG 3 2022: 2 December 2022 (virtual)

Agenda

Date and Time: 02/12/2022- 09:00-11:30

Location: Microsoft Teams [Click here to join the meeting](#)

Chair Name: Sandy Morison

Attendees	Membership
Sandy Morison	Chair
Roshan Hanamseth	Executive Officer
Lara Ainley	AFMA member
Robin Thomson	Scientific member
Andrew Penney	Scientific member
Kyriakos Toumazos	Industry member
Jamie Papas	Industry member
Craig Harris	Industry member
Leigh Castle	Industry member
Anissa Lawrence	Environment/Conservation member
Julian Morison	Economic member
Charlie Huveneers	Scientific member
Apologies	Membership
Jamie Papas	Industry member
Leigh Castle	Industry member

Presenters	Organisation
Paul Burch	CSIRO
Invited attendees	Organisation
James Woodhams	ABARES
Ross Bromley	Southern Shark Industry Association
Miriana Sporcic	CSIRO
Observers	Organisation
Dan Corrie	AFMA
Nastaran Mazloumi	AFMA
Kurt Davis	ABARES

Approximate time	Item	Purpose	Lead presenter
09:00 (15 min)	Agenda item 1. Preliminaries 1.1 Welcome and apologies 1.2 Declaration of interests 1.3 Adoption of agenda	For action	Chair
09:15 (75 min)	Agenda item 2. Metier analysis	For advice	Paul Burch
10:30 (60 min)	Agenda item 3. Research priorities	For advice	AFMA member
	Agenda item 4. Other business	For discussion	AFMA member
11:30	Close of meeting		